



STATE OF ARIZONA
ARIZONA STATE LIQUOR BOARD
800 WEST WASHINGTON, 5TH FLOOR
PHOENIX, AZ 85007
Website: www.azliquor.gov

KATIE HOBBS
Governor

TROY L. CAMPBELL
Board Chair

BEN HENRY
Director

Arizona State Liquor Board Hearing Minutes
March 7, 2024

Members Present: Troy L. Campbell – Chairman
Jill Pernice
Victoria Yarbrough
Paul David

Members Absent: Lynn Shulman – Vice Chair

Counsel Present: Linda Bergevin, Assistant Attorney General

Staff Present: Haley Garcia, Board Administrator

A. Call to Order

The hearing of the Arizona State Liquor Board was called to order on March 7, 2024, at 9:00 a.m. with Chairman Campbell presiding. Google Meet was utilized for facilitating the meeting. Board members, staff and all parties participated either online or telephonically. All Board members who were present submitted their conflict of disclosure memorandums to the Board Administrator prior to the start of the hearing. All Board members who were present did not have “substantial interest” with any matters set on the agenda.

Roll Call

Vice Chair Lynn Shulman was absent. All other members were present.

B. 9:00 a.m. Agenda: Review, consideration and action

1. Denial of Beer and Wine Store Liquor License Application, No. 256242

Josh Rios, Agent
Carnieria Y Panaderia La Exclusiva LLC
Carniceria Y Panaderia La Exclusiva
1640 N. 36th St.
#A105/A106
Phoenix, AZ 85008

This matter was set for hearing due to the City of Phoenix’s recommendation for disapproval based on the Applicant’s unresolved matters with the City of Phoenix’s building and zoning requirements, noncompliance with Code and Ordinances, and a Finance Department’s recommendation for disapproval.

The Applicant, Josh Rios, was not present. Assistant City Prosecutor Kunal Patel appeared on behalf of the City of Phoenix. Mr. Patel presented oral arguments to the Board in regard to why the Applicant should not be granted a liquor license.

Chairman Campbell inquired Ms. Garcia regarding the correct application number because the local governing body recommendation, posting, and minutes’ number differed from what was shown on the agenda. Ms. Garcia clarified that the application number on the agenda was an error, and that the correct application number is 256242. Ms. Bergevin ensured that proper notice was provided to the Applicant with the correct application number, and confirmed it with Chairman Campbell and Ms. Garcia.

Ms. Bergevin explained that the notice requirement was met, that the correct application number has been clarified, and that all other identifying information has been made part of the record. All Board members, Ms. Bergevin, and Mr. Patel verbally declared they are comfortable moving forward.

Motion

Mr. David invited the motion to find Liquor License Application No. 256242, Beer and Wine Store, by Josh Rios for Carniceria Y Panaderia La Exclusiva LLC not capable, qualified, and reliable because of their absence at the hearing, incompleteness of Title IV basic training, and recommendation for disapproval by the City of Phoenix.

| | |
|---------------|---|
| Seconded - | Pernice |
| Yay - | Campbell, Pernice, Yarbrough, David |
| Nay - | None |
| Abstained - | None |
| Disposition - | Beer and Wine Store Liquor License Application No. 256242, Carniceria Y Panaderia La Exclusiva LLC, dba Carniceria Y Panaderia La Exclusiva, has been denied. |

C. Approval of Minutes: Review, Consideration and Action

Ms. Yarbrough invited the motion to approve the minutes of January 11, 2024. Mr. David seconded the motion.

| | |
|---------------|---|
| Seconded - | David |
| Yay - | Campbell, Pernice, David, Yarbrough |
| Nay - | None |
| Abstained - | None |
| Disposition - | The minutes from the January 11, 2024 Board meeting are approved. |

D. Election of Officers: Chair and Vice Chair

Nomination of Troy Campbell to serve another year as Chairman of the Arizona State Liquor Board.

Seconded - Pernice
Yay - Campbell, Pernice, David, Yarbrough
Nay - None
Abstained - None
Disposition - Troy Campbell has been reelected Chairman of the Arizona State Liquor Board.

Nomination of Lynn Shulman to serve another year as Vice Chair of the Arizona State Liquor Board.

Seconded - Yarbrough
Yay - Campbell, Pernice, David, Yarbrough
Nay - None
Abstained - None
Disposition - Lynn Shulman has been reelected Vice Chair of the Arizona State Liquor Board.

E. Reports on Current Events, Matters of Board Procedure, Requests and Items for Future Agenda

Chairman Campbell spoke upon the upcoming hearing schedule for 2024. Due to no matters being set for the April 4, 2024 hearing, it is cancelled. The next hearing is scheduled for May 2, 2024.

Chairman Campbell raised awareness to the Board members that the legislative session is active now and encouraged Board members to review the Liquor Omnibus bill.

Chairman Campbell informed the Board and public that if a member of the public would like to protest a liquor license application, they must qualify as a protester and fill out the public protest form that is available on the Department of Liquor Licenses and Control’s website.

Ms. Pernice requested the number for the Liquor Omnibus bill, in which Ms. Garcia stated she will share the number with all Board members.

Mr. David inquired, due to the two vacancies on the Board, if one can serve without Senate appointment. Chairman Campbell directed Mr. David to Boards and Commissions at the Governor’s Office because they handle all Board applications and appointments.


F. Call to the Public

Department of Liquor Licenses and Control’s Assistant Director and General Counsel, Gino Duran, addressed the Board regarding a general document that the legislative specialist created with the bill numbers and links relating to the DLLC. Mr. Duran forwarded this document to Ms. Garcia to share with the Board members. Mr. Duran explained that there have been productive conversations with Boards and Commissions at the Governor’s Office regarding vacancies and encourages applications. Mr. Duran clarified that the protests are a public right, but that the Department does not accept anonymous protests. The Department has previously received fraudulent protests and any fraudulent or forged protests is a crime, and will be treated as such.

Motion

Ms. Pernice made the motion to adjourn meeting at 9:56 a.m. Ms. Yarbrough seconded the motion.

| | |
|---------------|-------------------------------------|
| Seconded - | Yarbrough |
| Yay - | Campbell, David, Pernice, Yarbrough |
| Nay - | None |
| Abstained - | None |
| Disposition - | Meeting adjourned at 9:56 a.m. |



Haley Garcia
Administrator of the
Arizona State Liquor Board

05/03/2024

Date